

# Disproving a Conjecture on *PI*-Index of Graphs\*

Gang Ma, Jianfeng Wang<sup>†</sup>

*School of Mathematics and Statistics, Shandong University of Technology,  
Zibo 255049, China*

math\_magang@163.com, jfwang@sdut.edu.cn

(Received September 26, 2021)

## Abstract

The PI-index of a graph  $G$  is defined by  $PI(G) = \sum_{e=uv \in E} (m_u(e) + m_v(e))$ , where  $m_u(e)$  is the number of edges in  $G$  lying closer to the vertex  $u$  than to the vertex  $v$ . In this paper, using probabilistic method we disprove a conjecture about the PI-index posed by Khalifeh et al. [Order of Magnitude of the PI index, MATCH Commun. Math. Comput. Chem. 65 (2011) 51–56].

## 1 Introduction

All graphs considered here are simple and undirected. For notations and terminologies used but not defined here, we refer to [1, 2].

A *topological index* is a real number related to a graph. It must be a structural invariant, i.e., it is preserved by every graph automorphism. Several topological indices have been defined and many of them have found applications as means for modeling chemical, pharmaceutical and other properties of molecules. We here focus on the so-called *PI-index* of graphs.

Let  $G = (V(G), E(G))$  be a connected graph with order  $n = |V(G)|$ . As usual, the *distance* between the vertices  $u$  and  $v$  of  $G$  is denoted by  $d(u, v)$  and it is defined as

---

\*Supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 11971274)

<sup>†</sup>Corresponding author.

the number of edges in a minimal path connecting the vertices  $u$  and  $v$ . For an edge  $e = xy \in E(G)$ , we define the *edge-distance* of the edge  $e$  to a vertex  $z \in V(G)$  as follows:

$$d(z, e) = \min\{d(z, x), d(z, y)\}.$$

For  $e = uv \in E(G)$ , let  $E_u(e)$  be the subset of edges of  $E(G)$  which are closer to  $u$  than  $v$ , and  $E_v(e)$  be the subset of edges of  $E(G)$  which are closer to  $v$  than  $u$ ; More precisely,

$$E_u(e) = \{f \mid d(u, f) < d(f, v), f \in E(G)\} \quad \text{and} \quad E_v(e) = \{f \mid d(v, f) < d(f, u), f \in E(G)\}.$$

Set  $m_u(e) = |E_u(e)|$  and  $m_v(e) = |E_v(e)|$ . Then, the *Padmakar-Ivan index* [7], abbreviated as PI-index, is defined as

$$\text{PI}(G) = \sum_{e=uv \in E(G)} (m_u(e) + m_v(e)).$$

About the PI-index, there are already many published papers on its mathematical properties [3, 8, 10, 11, 14, eg.], and on its applications to the chemical properties of molecules [5, 6, 12, 13, eg.]. For more results, the readers can search the related papers online.

Although the background of PI-index comes from the chemistry, as a graph parameter it is an important topological index based on the distances in graphs. From this viewpoint, we will consider the order of magnitude of the PI-index, and disprove a nearly decade-old conjecture by the probabilistic method.

In 2011, Khalifeh, Yousefi-Azari and Ashrafi [9] not only constructed a sequence  $\{G_n\}_{n \geq 1}$  of connected graphs such that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\text{PI}(G_n)}{n^4} = \frac{5}{256}$ , but put forward the following conjecture.

**Conjecture 1.** [9] *For every sequence  $\{G_n\}_{n \geq 1}$ ,  $|V(G_n)| = n$ , of connected graphs,*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\text{PI}(G_n)}{n^4} \leq \frac{3}{5^3}.$$

*Moreover, the bound is sharp.*

Note that  $\frac{3}{5^3} = 0.024$ . In next section, we firstly investigate the expectation of the PI-index of random graph  $G(n, p)$ , and then disprove the above conjecture. In Section 3, we give some remarks and propose two problems for future study.

## 2 Main results

Let  $n$  be a positive integer and  $0 \leq p \leq 1$ . The Gilbert random graph  $G(n, p)$  is a probability space over the set of graphs on the vertex set  $\{1, 2, \dots, n\}$  determined by

$$\Pr[\{i, j\} \in G] = p$$

with these events mutually independent [4].

**Lemma 2.1.** *The expectation of PI index of  $G(n, p)$  is at least*

$$2 \binom{n}{2} \binom{n-2}{2} p^3 (1-p)^2 (2-p).$$

*Proof.* Let  $u, v$  be any two vertices of  $G(n, p)$ . Clearly, there are  $\binom{n}{2}$  such choices. Suppose  $e = uv$  be an edge of  $G(n, p)$ . Let  $m_u(e)$  and  $m_v(e)$  be defined as in Section 1. We next compute  $m_u(e)$  and  $m_v(e)$ .

Selecting two vertices  $x, y \in V(G(n, p)) \setminus \{u, v\}$ , we have  $\binom{n-2}{2}$  such choices. Note that  $xy$  has probability  $p$  of being an edge of  $G(n, p)$ . Assume that  $xy$  is an edge of  $G(n, p)$ . Firstly, we consider the case that the distance between the edge  $xy$  and  $u$  is less than the distance between the edge  $xy$  and  $v$ . We just consider that at least one vertex of  $\{x, y\}$  is adjacent to  $u$ , and both vertices  $\{x, y\}$  are not adjacent to  $v$ . Easily to obtain the probability that at least one vertex of  $\{x, y\}$  is adjacent to  $u$  is  $1 - (1-p)^2 = p(2-p)$ , and the probability that both vertices  $\{x, y\}$  are not adjacent to  $v$  is  $(1-p)^2$ . Hence, the probability that at least one vertex of  $\{x, y\}$  is adjacent to  $u$  and both vertices  $\{x, y\}$  are not adjacent to  $v$  is  $p(2-p) \cdot (1-p)^2$ . Therefore,

$$m_u(e) \geq \binom{n-2}{2} p \cdot p(2-p) \cdot (1-p)^2 = \binom{n-2}{2} p^2 (1-p)^2 (2-p).$$

Similarly, we get  $m_v(e) \geq \binom{n-2}{2} p^2 (1-p)^2 (2-p)$ . So, the expectation of PI-index of  $G(n, p)$  can be computed as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} E[\text{PI}(G(n, p))] &\geq \binom{n}{2} p \left[ \binom{n-2}{2} p^2 (1-p)^2 (2-p) + \binom{n-2}{2} p^2 (1-p)^2 (2-p) \right] \\ &= 2 \binom{n}{2} \binom{n-2}{2} p^3 (1-p)^2 (2-p). \end{aligned}$$

This finishes the proof. ■

We are now in the stage to disprove Conjecture 1.

**Theorem 2.2.** For large enough  $n$ , there exists a graph  $H_n$  of order  $n$  such that the coefficient of  $n^4$  in  $\text{PI}(H_n)$  is greater or equal to  $\frac{587-143\sqrt{13}}{2916}$ . In other words,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\text{PI}(H_n)}{n^4} \geq \frac{587 - 143\sqrt{13}}{2916} = 0.02448+ .$$

Consequently, Conjecture 1 invalidates.

*Proof.* Let  $f(p) = p^3(1-p)^2(2-p)$  with  $0 < p < 1$ . A direct calculation shows that the derivative of  $f(p)$  on  $p$  is

$$f'(p) = -6p^5 + 20p^4 - 20p^3 + 6p^2,$$

whose root belonging to the interval  $(0, 1)$  is  $p = \frac{7-\sqrt{13}}{6}$ . Thereby, the maximum value of  $f(p)$  is  $\frac{587-143\sqrt{13}}{1458}$ . Since  $2\binom{n}{2}\binom{n-2}{2} \sim \frac{1}{2}n^4$ , by  $p = \frac{7-\sqrt{13}}{6}$  we obtain

$$2\binom{n}{2}\binom{n-2}{2}p^3(1-p)^2(2-p) \sim \frac{587 - 143\sqrt{13}}{2916}n^4.$$

So, there exists a graph  $H_n$  of order  $n$  such that

$$\text{PI}(H_n) \geq E[\text{PI}(G(n, p))].$$

Due to  $\frac{587-143\sqrt{13}}{2916} > \frac{3}{5^3}$ , we conclude that Conjecture 1 is invalid.

The proof is completed. ■

### 3 Concluding remarks

In this paper, we mainly prove that the Conjecture 1 is incorrect. Nevertheless, we still do not know the maximum order of magnitude of the PI-indices of graphs. In the end, we pose the following two problems to finish this paper.

**Problem 1.** Among all connected graphs of order  $n$ , find the the maximum order of magnitude of the PI-indices.

**Problem 2.** Construct a graph  $G$  of order  $n$  such that the coefficient of  $n^4$  in  $\text{PI}(G)$  is at least  $\frac{587-143\sqrt{13}}{2916}$ .

---

## References

- [1] N. Alon, J. H. Spencer, *The Probabilistic Method*, Wiley, Hoboken, 2016.
- [2] J. A. Bondy, U. S. R. Murty, *Graph Theory*, Springer, Berlin, 2008.
- [3] A. R. Ashrafi, B. Manoochehrian, H. Yousefi-Azari, On the PI polynomial of a graph, *Util. Math.* **71** (2006) 97–108.
- [4] E. N. Gilbert, Random graphs, *Ann. Math. Statist.* **30** (1959) 1141–1144.
- [5] I. Gutman, A. R. Ashrafi, On the PI index of phenylenes and their hexagonal squeezes, *MATCH Commun. Math. Comput. Chem.* **60** (2008) 135–142.
- [6] P. E. John, P. V. Khadikar, J. Singh, A method of computing the PI index of benzenoid hydrocarbons using orthogonal cuts, *J. Math. Chem.* **42** (2007) 37–45.
- [7] P. V. Khadikar, On a novel structural descriptor PI, *Nat. Acad. Sci. Lett.* **23** (2000) 113–118.
- [8] M. H. Khalifeh, H. Yousefi-Azari, A. R. Ashrafi, A matrix method for computing Szeged and vertex PI indices of join and composition of graphs, *Lin. Algebra Appl.* **429** (2008) 2702–2709.
- [9] M. H. Khalifeh, H. Yousefi-Azari, A. R. Ashrafi, Order of Magnitude of the PI index, *MATCH Commun. Math. Comput. Chem.* **65** (2011) 51–56.
- [10] S. Klavžar, On the PI index: PI-partitions and Cartesian product graphs, *MATCH Commun. Math. Comput. Chem.* **57** (2007) 572–583.
- [11] G. Ma, Q. J. Bian, J. F. Wang, The weighted vertex PI index of  $(n, m)$ -graphs with given diameter, *Appl. Math. Comput.* **354** (2019) 329–337.
- [12] T. Mansour, M. Schork, The PI index of polomino chains of  $4k$ -cycles, *Acta Appl. Math.* **109** (2010) 671–681.
- [13] N. Tratnik, Computing weighted Szeged and PI indices from quotient graphs, *Int. J. Quantum Chem.* **119** (2019) #e26006.
- [14] Ž. Kovijanić Vukićević, D. Stevanović, Bicyclic graphs with extremal values of PI index, *Discr. Appl. Math.* **161** (2013) 395–403.