

A mathematical note on Koptsik's definition of
imperfect crystals

by Andreas W.M. Dress, Bielefeld

In the following note I would like to give a formal mathematical definition of generalized wreath products and, then, to apply this concept towards the problem of how to define imperfect crystals and their symmetry groups, both according to what I learned from Koptsik.

§ 1 Generalized wreath products.

Let G and H be groups with neutral elements 1_G and 1_H , such that G acts on H by automorphisms, i.e. there exists a map

$$(1) \quad G \times H \rightarrow H : (g, h) \mapsto g_h$$

such that for $g, g_1, g_2 \in G; h_1, h_2, h \in H$

$$(2) \quad g_{(h_1 h_2)} = g_{h_1} \cdot g_{h_2}, \quad (g_1 g_2)_h = g_1(g_{2h}), \quad 1_G h = h.$$

Let A be a G -set, i.e. a set A together with a map

$$(3) \quad G \times A \rightarrow A : (g, a) \mapsto ga,$$

such that for $g_1, g_2 \in G, a \in A$

$$(4) \quad (g_1 g_2)a = g_1(g_2 a), \quad 1_G a = a.$$

Let B be a H -set on which G acts compatible with its action on H , i.e. a set B together with two maps

$$(5) \quad H \times B \rightarrow B : (h, b) \mapsto h \cdot b; \quad G \times B \rightarrow B : (g, b) \mapsto g_b$$

such that for $h_1, h_2, h \in H; g_1, g_2, g \in G, b \in B$

$$(6) \quad (h_1 h_2) \cdot b = h_1 \cdot (h_2 \cdot b), \quad 1_H \cdot b = b, \quad (g_1 g_2)_b = g_1(g_{2b}), \quad 1_G b = b, \quad g_{(h \cdot b)} = g_h \cdot g_b.$$

In this situation we want to define a generalized wreath product $H \int_A G = H^A \rtimes G$ of H and G with respect to A together with a natural action of this group on the cartesian product $A \times B$ and the function space B^A of all maps from A into B .

We do not exclude the case, in which G acts trivially on H and B , in which case our definitions reduce to that of ordinary wreath products.

At first we define the group H^A of all maps $f : A \rightarrow H$ from A into H with multiplication defined as usual argument wise, i.e. - with $f_1, f_2 \in H^A, a \in A$ - by

$$(7) \quad (f_1 \cdot f_2)(a) = f_1(a) \cdot f_2(a).$$

G acts on H^A in a natural way by automorphisms: for $g \in G, f \in H^A$ and $a \in A$

we put

$$(8) \quad (g_f)(a) = g_f(g^{-1}a).$$

Then we have for $g_1, g_2, g \in G; f, f_1, f_2 \in H^A$

$$(9) \quad g_1 g_2 f = g_1 (g_2 f), \quad l_{Gf} = f, \quad g(f_1 f_2) = g_{f_1} g_{f_2}$$

since for all $a \in A$:

$$(10) \quad \begin{aligned} (g_1 (g_2 f))(a) &= g_1 \left((g_2 f)(g_1^{-1}a) \right) = g_1 (g_2 f (g_1^{-1}a)) \\ &= (g_1 g_2 f)(a), \quad (l_{Gf})(a) = f(a) \end{aligned}$$

and

$$(11) \quad \begin{aligned} (g_{f_1} \cdot g_{f_2})(a) &= (g_{f_1})(a) \cdot (g_{f_2})(a) = g_{f_1}(g^{-1}a) \cdot g_{f_2}(g^{-1}a) \\ &= g(f_1(g^{-1}a) \cdot f_2(g^{-1}a)) = g((f_1 \cdot f_2)(g^{-1}a)) = (g(f_1 \cdot f_2))(a). \end{aligned}$$

Thus we can define the semi-direct product $H^A \rtimes G$ of H^A and G , consisting of all pairs (f, g) with $f \in H^A$ and $g \in G$, and the multiplication, defined for $(f_1, g_1), (f_2, g_2) \in H^A \rtimes G$ by

$$(12) \quad (f_1, g_1) \cdot (f_2, g_2) = (f_1 \cdot g_1 f_2, g_1 g_2).$$

We also write $H \int_A G$ instead of $H^A \rtimes G$.

The group H^A , identified with the set $H^A \times l_G$ of pairs (f, l_G) , is normal in $H \int G$ and its factorgroup is canonically isomorphic to G . In H^A the group $(H^A)_{\text{const}}$ of all constant maps $A \rightarrow H$, being identifiable with H , is G -invariant, (though not necessarily normal in H^A), thus $H \int_A G$ contains the semi-direct product $H \rtimes G$ in a canonical way as a subgroup. Further interesting G -invariant subgroups of H^A are for infinite A the subgroup $(H^A)_{\text{fin}}$ of all maps $f: A \rightarrow H$ with $f(a) = l_H$ for all but finitely many $a \in A$ and the group $(H^A)_{\text{alm.const}}$ of all almost constant maps $f: A \rightarrow H$, i.e. all maps f , for which there exists $h \in H$ with $f(a) = h$ for all but finitely many $a \in A$. Obviously

$$(13) \quad (H^A)_{\text{alm.const.}} = (H^A)_{\text{fin.}} \cdot (H^A)_{\text{const}} = (H^A)_{\text{const}} \cdot (H^A)_{\text{fin.}}$$

Moreover, if A possesses the structure of a topological space and each $g \in G$ acts continuously on A , the group $(H^A)_{\text{disc}}$ (or $(H^A)_{\text{comp}}$) of all maps $f: A \rightarrow H$ with $f(a) = l_H$ for all $a \in A$ except for a in some discrete (or compact) subset $A' \subseteq A$, is a G -invariant subgroup of H^A , which will be of some importance later on.

Finally, for any G -invariant subgroup $H' \leq H$ the group H'^A of all maps $A \rightarrow H'$ is a G -invariant subgroup of H^A and so are $(H'^A)_{\text{const}} = H'^A \cap (H^A)_{\text{const}}$,

$$\begin{aligned} (H^A)_{\text{alm.const}} &= H^A \cap (H^A)_{\text{alm.const}}. \quad (H^A)_{\text{fin.}} = H^A \cap (H^A)_{\text{fin.}} \text{ and} \\ (H^A)_{\text{disc.}} &= H^A \cap (H^A)_{\text{disc.}} \end{aligned}$$

For all these G -invariant subgroups $V \leq H^A$ we can form the semi-direct product $V \rtimes G$ as a subgroup of $H \int_A G$. In particular, $H_1 \int_A G \leq H \int_A G$ for any G -invariant subgroup $H_1 \leq H$ of H .

Now let us define and study the action of $H \int_A G$ on $A \times B$ and on B^A . For $(f, g) \in H^A \rtimes G = H \int_A G$ and $(a, b) \in A \times B$ we put

$$(14) \quad (f, g) \cdot (a, b) = (ga, f(ga) \cdot {}^g b).$$

Obviously $1_{H \int_A G} \cdot (a, b) = (a, b)$ and for $(f_1, g_1), (f_2, g_2) \in H \int_A G$

$$\begin{aligned} (15) \quad (f_1, g_1) \left((f_2, g_2) (a, b) \right) &= (f_1, g_1) \left(g_2 a, f_2(g_2 a) \cdot {}^{g_2} b \right) \\ &= \left(g_1 g_2 a, f_1(g_1 g_2 a) \cdot {}^{g_1} (f_2(g_2 a) \cdot {}^{g_2} b) \right) = \\ &= \left(g_1 g_2 a, f_1(g_1 g_2 a) \cdot {}^{g_1} (f_2(g_1^{-1} \cdot g_1 g_2 a) \cdot {}^{g_1} {}^{g_2} b) \right) = \\ &= \left(g_1 g_2 a, f_1(g_1 g_2 a) \cdot ({}^{g_1} f_2) (g_1 g_2 a) \cdot {}^{g_1} {}^{g_2} b \right) = \\ &= \left(f_1 \cdot {}^{g_1} f_2, g_1 g_2 \right) \cdot (a, b) = \left((f_1, g_1) \cdot (f_2, g_2) \right) (a, b), \end{aligned}$$

so (14) defines indeed an action of $H \int_A G$ on $A \times B$. This implies an action of $H \int_A G$ on B^A , considered as a subset of $P(A \times B)$, the set of subsets of $A \times B$. More precisely, for $F : A \rightarrow B$ an element in B^A , $(f, g) \in H \int_A G$ and $a \in A$ we put

$$(16) \quad {}^g F : A \rightarrow B : a \mapsto {}^g (F(g^{-1}a)),$$

defining an action of G on B^A , and get

$$(17) \quad ((f, g)F) (a) = f(a) \cdot {}^g (F(g^{-1}a)) = f(a) \cdot ({}^g F) (a).$$

Our first result is

Theorem 1: If H acts transitively on B , then $H^A \leq H \int_A G$ acts transitively on B^A . If H acts fixed point free on B (i.e. if $h \cdot b = b^A$ for some $h \in H$ and some $b \in B$ implies $h = 1_H$), then $H^A \leq H \int_A G$ acts fixed point free on B^A .

Proof: If $F, F' \in B^A$ and H acts transitively on B , we may choose for $a \in A$ an element $f(a) \in H$ with $f(a) \cdot F(a) = F'(a)$ and thus $(f, 1_G) \cdot F = F'$.

If H acts fixed point free on B and $(f, 1_G) \cdot F = F$, then $f(a) \cdot F(a) = F(a)$ for all $a \in A$ implies $f(a) = 1_H$ for all $a \in A$ and thus $(f, 1_G) = 1_{H \int_A G}$.

Corollary 1: If H acts regularly on B (i.e. if H acts transitively and fixed point free on B), then H^A acts regularly on B^A .

For any $F \in B^A$ let $(H_f^G)_F = \{(f, g) \in H_f^G \mid (f, g) \cdot F = F\}$ be the (full) "symmetry group" of F . Since $(H_f^G)_F = (g, f) \cdot (H_f^G)_F \cdot (g, f)^{-1}$, all symmetry groups are conjugate in H_f^G , if H acts transitively on B . Thus, it seems more appropriate to classify elements $F, F', \dots \in B^A$ with respect to the action of G , say, considered as a subgroup of H_f^G , or some other significant subgroup.

Concerning the structure of $(H_f^G)_F$, we have

Corollary 2: If H acts transitively/fixed point free/regularly on B and if $F \in B^A$, then the canonical map $H_f^G \rightarrow G : (f, g) \mapsto g$ maps the symmetry group $(H_f^G)_F$ of F surjectively/injectively/bijectively into G .

Proof: The kernel of $(H_f^G)_F \rightarrow G : (f, g) \mapsto g$ consists of all $f \in H^A$ with $(f, 1_G) \cdot F = F$ and, thus, is trivial, if H acts fixed point free on B . If H acts transitively on B , we can find for each $g \in G$ some $f \in H^A$ with $(1_A, g) \cdot F = (f, 1_G) \cdot F$; so we have for any $g \in G$ some $f \in H^A$ with $(f^{-1}, g) \in (H_f^G)_F$, and since this element $(f^{-1}, g) \in (H_f^G)_F$ will be mapped onto g , we see, that the transitivity of the action of H on B implies surjectivity of $(H_f^G)_F \rightarrow G$.

§ 2 Imperfect crystals

Now let A be the 3-dimensional euclidean space \mathbb{E}^3 and let G be the group $O(\mathbb{E}^3)$ of all isometries of \mathbb{E}^3 . Thus $O(\mathbb{E}^3)$ contains the subgroup $O^+(\mathbb{E}^3)$ of index 2 of all proper (orientation preserving) isometries of \mathbb{E}^3 and the translational subgroup $T \leq O^+(\mathbb{E}^3)$, consisting of all translations of \mathbb{E}^3 . Obviously $T \cong \mathbb{R}^3$, $O(\mathbb{E}^3)/T \cong O_3(\mathbb{R})$, the 3-dimensional orthogonal group, and $O(\mathbb{E}^3) \cong T \rtimes O_3(\mathbb{R}) = \mathbb{R}^3 \rtimes O(\mathbb{R}^3)$, the semi-direct product of \mathbb{R}^3 and $O(\mathbb{R}^3)$, taken with respect to the natural action of $O(\mathbb{R}^3)$ on \mathbb{R}^3 . We write $\det(g) = +1$, if $g \in O^+(\mathbb{E}^3)$ and $\det g = -1$ otherwise.

For the choice of B and H we discuss several possibilities: we may either choose $B = B_0$ as just a finite set, consisting of various symbols X_0, X_1, \dots, X_n for chemical substances, particularly chemical elements, but including one symbol, say X_0 , for the "empty substance", and $H = H_0$ as the group Σ_B of all permutations of B_0 , with G acting trivially on B_0 and H_0 , or we may choose $B = B_1$ as a finite set, consisting of symbols $X_0, X_1, \dots, X_k, X_{k+1}^+, X_{k+1}^-, \dots, X_n^+, X_n^-$ for chemical substances, some of which (more precisely, the last $n - k$ of which) come with a pregiven orientation $+$ or $-$ in our three-space, and we may choose $H = H_1$ to consist of all permutations π of $X_0, \dots, X_k, X_{k+1}^+, X_{k+1}^-, \dots, X_n^+, X_n^-$ which permute the X_0, \dots, X_k among themselves and the $X_{k+1}^+, X_{k+1}^-, \dots, X_n^+, X_n^-$ in such a way, that $\pi(X_i^\epsilon) = X_j^\eta \iff \pi(X_i^{-\epsilon}) = X_j^{-\eta}$ ($i, j = k+1, \dots, n$; $\epsilon, \eta \in \{+, -\}$), with G acting

trivially on H_1 and on $\{X_0, \dots, X_k\}$, but $gX_i^e = X_i^e \cdot \det g$ for $i = k+1, \dots, n$; $e \in \{+, -\}$, $g \in G = O(\mathbb{E}^3)$.

Finally we may choose $B = B_2$ to consist of, say, $B_0 \times S^2$ (or $B_1 \times S^2$ or $\{X_0, \dots, X_k\} \cup \{X_{k+1}^+, X_{k+1}^-, \dots, X_e^+, X_e^-\} \cup \{X_{e+1}, \dots, X_n\} \times S^2$) with $S^2 \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$ the unit sphere in \mathbb{R}^3 , - so any element in B_2 consists - essentially - of a chemical substance X_i together with a pregiven direction in \mathbb{E}^3 -, and we may put $H_2 = H_0 \times O(\mathbb{R}^3)$ (or $H_1 \times O(\mathbb{R}^3)$ or ...), acting on $B_0 \times S^2$ component wise, with G acting on $H_2 = H_0 \times O(\mathbb{R}^3)$ and $B = B_0 \times S^2$ via the homomorphism $G = O(\mathbb{E}^3) \rightarrow O(\mathbb{R}^3)$ and the latter group's natural action on the second component, i.e. either by conjugation or the standard action of $O(\mathbb{R}^3)$ on S^2 .

In any case we get a natural action of $H \int_{\mathbb{E}^3} O(\mathbb{E}^3)$ on $B^{\mathbb{E}^3}$. Now let $V \leq H^{\mathbb{E}^3}$ be G -invariant, e.g. one of the groups discussed above. The central definition of an imperfect crystal is now the following:

Definition 1: Using the above notations we define an element $F \in B^{\mathbb{E}^3}$ to be an imperfect crystal structure relative to $V \leq H^{\mathbb{E}^3}$, if the canonical map $H \int_{\mathbb{E}^3} G \rightarrow G$ maps $(V \rtimes G)_F$ onto a crystallographic subgroup U of G , i.e. a discrete subgroup with a compact quotient space.

To define equivalence of such imperfect crystal structures we imbed $G = O(\mathbb{E}^3)$ into the group $G_1 = A(\mathbb{E}^3)$ of affine transformations of \mathbb{E}^3 , which acts on all H 's and B 's in a natural and compatible way. Thus we can form $H \int_{\mathbb{E}^3} G_1$ and consider subgroups $W \leq H \int_{\mathbb{E}^3} G_1$ of this group, e.g. G_1 itself, identified with $1 \int_{\mathbb{E}^3} G_1$, or $V \rtimes G_1$ in case V is not only G -, but also G_1 -invariant. With these notations we have

Definition 2: Two imperfect crystal structures $F_1, F_2 \in B^{\mathbb{E}^3}$ are W -equivalent, if there exists some element $w \in W$ with $w(V \rtimes G)_F w^{-1} = (V \rtimes G)_{F_2}$.

Let us discuss some special cases:

In case $V = \{1\}$, the trivial group, we get the usual perfect crystal structures.

In case $B = B_0 = \{X_0, X_1, X_2\}$ and $V = (H^{\mathbb{E}^3})_{\text{const}}$ with $H' \leq H_0 = \Sigma_{B_0}$ the subgroup of order 2, consisting of the identity and the permutation, permuting X_1 and X_2 and fixing X_0 , we get - essentially - the well known Shubnikov-groups.

In case $B = B_0 = \{X_0, X_1, \dots, X_n\}$ and $V = H^{\mathbb{E}^3}$ with $H' \leq H_0 = \Sigma_{B_0}$ consisting of some (or all) permutations fixing X_0 , we get, at least, those imperfect crystals, whose underlying geometric crystal structure is perfect, i.e. the crystal structure, we get by neglecting the difference between the various substances X_1, \dots, X_n and taking into account only their position in three space.

In case $B = B_0 = \{X_0, \dots, X_n\}$ and $V = (H^{\mathbb{E}^3})_{\text{fin}}$ or $V = (H^{\mathbb{E}^3})_{\text{comp}}$ we get those crystal structures which differ from being perfect only at a finite or a

compact set of places, whereas in case $V = (H_o^E)^3$ we may get crystal structures of the following kind: at first we define an underlying perfect crystal structure $F : E^3 \rightarrow B_o$, such that for any $x_i \in B_o$ the preimage $F^{-1}(x_i)$ is either empty or non-discrete and then we disturb F a little by changing its values at a discrete set of places.

References

B.H. Neumann: Compositio Mathematica, Vol. 13, Fasc. I, pp. 47-64

———, Archiv der Mathematik, Vol. XIV, Fasc. 1, 1963, pp. 1-6.

V. Koptsik: Lectures and private communications.